Role of tumor necrosis factor-alpha in pathogenesis of recurrent aphthous stomatitis: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Paria Motahari DDS, MSc¹⁽¹⁰⁾, Fatemeh Pournagi-Azar DDS MSc², Pooya Khodadadi³

Review Article

Abstract

BACKGROUND AND AIM: Recurrent aphthous stomatitis (RAS) is a lesion of the oral cavity with an unknown etiology. Several studies have been performed on the role of tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF- α) in RAS. The main purpose of this paper was to review TNF- α level and its gene polymorphism in patients with RAS, the factors influencing the production of TNF- α , and its role in RAS development.

METHODS: In this review study, all articles containing English abstract were searched in the PubMed, Cochrane Library, and Scopus databases from January 2000 to December 2019. The searches were done using the Medical Subject Heading (MESH) terms and keywords of "recurrent aphthous stomatitis" or "recurrent aphthous ulcers" or "recurrent oral ulcers" and "tumor necrosis factor-alpha" or "TNF- α ". The data for gene polymorphism were analyzed using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis (CMA) software. Regarding the heterogeneity of studies, the random effects model was used. Cochran's Q and I² tests were used to evaluate statistical heterogeneity between the studies.

RESULTS: Amongst the 619 articles obtained in the first stage of our search of database, 21 articles which were fitted to our study based on the entry/exit criteria were selected in the review. According to this meta-analysis, recessive model of TNF- α -308 G/A had protective effects for RAS [odds ratio (OR) = 0.392, 95% confidence interval (CI) = 0.145-1.061, P = 0.045].

CONCLUSION: The results showed the important role of TNF- α in RAS development. There are numerous factors involved in producing this cytokine. Identifying TNF- α production pathway and its effects in RAS formation is significant in developing new prevention and treatment methods.

KEYWORDS: Tumor Necrosis Factor-Alpha; Polymorphism, Single Nucleotide; Stomatitis; Aphthous

Citation: Motahari P, Pournagi-Azar F, Khodadadi P. **Role of tumor necrosis factor-alpha in pathogenesis of recurrent aphthous stomatitis: A systematic review and meta-analysis.** J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol 2020; 9(3): 108-15.

R ecurrent aphthous stomatitis (RAS) has been known as the most common oral lesions in which 10%-20% of the world's population is affected. RAS is characterized by repeated ulceration with defined borders, which might be single or multiple and very painful. The healing of these ulcers is slow compared to traumatic lesions.¹ Several parameters including allergies, genetic predisposition, effects of hormones and immune factors,

blood disorders, infective agents, malnutrition, stress, and trauma are often considered in the RAS occurrence.2-4 However, the cause of the condition is not yet known and no definitive medication is available for its treatment and treatment of affected individuals consists of the symptomatic modalities.

Evidence suggests that aphthous lesions are caused by abnormal expression of cytokines in the oral mucosa, leading to increased cellular

108 J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol/ Summer 2020; Vol. 9, No. 3

¹⁻ Assistant Professor, Department of Oral Medicine, School of Dentistry, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

Assistant Professor, Department of Restorative Dentistry, School of Dentistry, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran
Student of Dentistry, Department of Oral Medicine, School of Dentistry, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

Address for correspondence: Paria Motahari DDS, MSc; Assistant Professor, Department of Oral Medicine, School of Dentistry, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran; Email: paria.motahari@yahoo.com

immune response in the focal areas of the oral mucosa. These cytokines include interleukins (IL) 1, 6, and 10 and tumor necrosis factoralpha (TNF- α). TNF- α is an essential cytokine produced by T lymphocytes and macrophages and is involved in the conversion of T lymphocytes to T helper 1 (Th1).⁵

Numerous studies have been performed to show the role of TNF-a in RAS. Some studies have examined TNF- α level in the tissues, saliva, and serum in RAS,6-19 and some others have investigated TNF-a the gene polymorphism in RAS and contradictory results have been presented.²⁰⁻²² Other studies have examined the factors affecting the production of TNF-a and the mechanisms of RAS formation by this cytokine.²³⁻²⁶ Due to the small volume of individual studies and other limitations, these studies have low statistical power and are poor in estimating disease risk. Also, due to inconsistent conclusions in this field, the aim of this study was to identify and comprehensively analyze all relevant clinical studies to investigate the levels of TNF- α in different samples, association of TNF- α gene polymorphism with RAS, production of TNFa, and its role in the RAS creation. Identifying TNF-a production pathway and its effects on RAS formation is significant in developing new prevention and treatment methods.

Methods

This systematic review study was accepted by the Ethics Committee of Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran (ethical code: IR.TBZMED.VCR.REC.1398.167).

This systematic review was conducted based on the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement for reporting systematic reviews.²⁷ A focused question was produced according to the Participants, Intervention, Control, and Outcomes (PICO) principles.²⁸ The focused question for this review was "Is there an association between TNF-α and RAS?" In this review study, all articles containing English abstract were searched according to the relevant keywords in the PubMed, Cochrane Library, and Scopus databases from January 2000 to December 2019. The keywords were selected based on Medical Subject Heading (MeSH) terms. The studies were retrieved by searching the key terms of "recurrent aphthous stomatitis" or "recurrent aphthous ulcers" or "recurrent oral ulcers" and "tumor necrosis factor-alpha" or "TNF-α".

A protocol was used for establishment of the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The casecontrol studies or cohort trials that evaluated association between RAS and TNF-a were selected without restrictions of variants of RAS. To select the studies, all articles that were in English or abstracted in English were reviewed, and titles and abstracts were screened for relevance. Studies were excluded if they were review, case report, letter to editor, or animal studies. Also, studies involving participants with systemic disease and studies that examined the effect of different drugs on the RAS were excluded. Endnote X5 reference management software was used to organize study titles and abstracts and identify duplicates. A random effect model was also used to perform the meta-analysis.

The studies were checked by one author to extract all the relevant data. Another author reevaluated the data. Disagreements were resolved with the third author's discussion. Quality assessment of obtained articles was performed according to the checklist which was provided by the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI).²⁹ Microsoft Excel (version 2010) was used to extract the characteristics of study. The details of the selected studies included the following: the name of the first author, publication year, country, design, sample size, and results.

The probability of each allele and genotype in the patient group was compared to the control group in the meta-analysis. Pooled odds ratios (ORs) were calculated for allelic model (G vs. A), homozygote model (AA vs. GG), heterozygote model (AG vs. GG), dominant model (AA + AG vs. GG), and recessive model (AA vs. AG + GG). Heterogeneity between studies was assessed by Cochran's Q and I² tests, which expressed the percentage of variation between studies. I² values below 25% were considered as heterogeneity, 50% as moderate, and above 75% as high heterogeneity. Statistical analysis was performed using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis (CMA) software (version 3.0) and P-value less than 0.05 was considered as significant level.

Results

In an initial research, 619 articles were identified through electronic database. After removing duplicated publications, 223 articles remained. Abstract of these studies were assessed for eligibility. Finally, 21 studies were evaluated. The flow chart for the identified articles is shown in figure 1. Of the 21 articles evaluated, 13 articles evaluated the TNF-a level in the different samples^{6-12,14-19} and one article was about the amount of TNF-aproducing cells,¹³ which are listed in table 1; 3 articles examined the polymorphism of the TNF- α gene in patients with RAS,²⁰⁻²² which are shown in table 2. As summarized in table 3. four articles evaluated the effect of different factors on the production of TNF- α and the mechanism of RAS creation by TNF-a.23-26

TNF- α -308 G/A was assessed in three trials with 201 cases and 240 controls.²⁰⁻²² As shown

in figure 2, pooled results indicated that the correlation between the TNF- α -308 G/A polymorphism and RAS risk was statistically significant in the recessive model [OR = 0.392, 95% confidence interval (CI) = 0.145-1.061, P = 0.045], but not in any other models. According to this meta-analysis, recessive model of TNF- α -308 G/A has protective effects for RAS.

Discussion

This study indicates that TNF-a has important effects on the RAS development. Numerous reports suggest that factors such as stress, hematinic deficiency, trauma, genetics, and cytokines can be effective in the formation of RAS.³ TNF- α is a main pro-inflammatory cytokine that plays an important role in immune and inflammatory responses.⁵ TNF-a actually shows important immunemodulatory activities and studies have shown its relationship with RAS. Thus, high levels of TNF-a have been reported in wound mucosa and peripheral blood of patients with aphthous ulcer.¹⁶⁻¹⁹ High cytotoxic destruction of epithelial cells with TNF-a produced from peripheral blood mononuclear cells was shown in patients with aphthous ulcer.16 In addition, RAS can be prevented by inhibitors of endogenous TNF-a synthesis such as thalidomide and pentoxifylline.³⁰



Figure 1. The flow chart of searching strategy based on PRISMA guidelines



http://johoe.kmu.ac.ir, 05 July

References	Study	Country	Sam	ple size	Sample	Results		
	design		RAS	Control				
Wei ⁶	Case-control	China	14	14	Saliva	The salivary TNF-α level in RAS group significantly increased compared with control group.		
Hegde ⁷	Case-control	India	30	30	Saliva	The salivary TNF- α level in RAS group significantly increased compared with control group.		
Chaudhuri ⁸	Case-control	India	30	30	Saliva	The salivary TNF-α level in RAS group significantly increased compared with control group.		
Avci ⁹	Case-control	Turkey	25	25	Serum	TNF- α level increased in the serum of the RAS group compared with those of the controls.		
Eguia-del ¹⁰	Case-control	Spain	20	10	Saliva	The salivary TNF-α level in RAS group significantly increased compared with control group.		
Lewkowicz ¹¹	Case-control	Poland	15	12	Tissue	mRNA expression for TNF-α was significantly higher in RAS group compared with their tissue controls.		
Borra ¹²	Case-control	Brazil	17	17	Serum and saliva	No significant difference was observed in serum and salivary TNF-α between RAS and control groups.		
Albanidou- Farmaki ¹³	Case-control	Greece	32	40	Peripheral blood	No statistical difference was observed in the number of TNF-α-producing cells between RAS group and controls.		
Dalghous ¹⁴	Case-control	UK	19	6	Tissue	Expression for TNF-α was significantly higher in RAS compared with their tissue controls.		
Boras ¹⁵	Case-control	Croatia	26	26	Saliva	The salivary TNF-α level in RAS group significantly increased compared with control group.		
Lewkowicz ¹⁶	Case-control	Poland	10	12	Tissue	A higher level of TNF-a in PBMC of patients with RAS was observed.		
Sun ¹⁷	Case-control	Taiwan	197	77	Serum	TNF- α level increased in the serum of RAS group compared with those of the controls.		
Yun-Qiu ¹⁸	Case-control	China	32	30	Serum	TNF- α level increased in the serum compared with those of the controls.		
Natah ¹⁹	Case-control	Finland	12	10	Tissue	Expression for TNF- α was significantly higher in mononuclear inflammatory cells, mast cells, and vascular endothelial cells of RAS lesions compared with their tissue controls.		

Table 1. Articles evaluating the tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF- α) level in the different samples

RAS: Recurrent aphthous stomatitis; TNF-α: Tumor necrosis factor-alpha; mRNA: Messenger ribonucleic acid; PBMC: Peripheral blood mononuclear cell; UK: United Kingdom

References	Study design	Genotyping method	Number					Country	
			Male	Female	Total case (RAS group)	Mean age (year)	Control	Mean age (year)	
Sun ²⁰	Case-control	PCR	22	20	42	46.70	86	43.90	China
Guimaraes ²¹	Case-control	PCR	28	36	64	31.70	64	36.90	Brazil
Bazrafshani ²²	Case-control	PCR	33	62	95	37.33	90	37.33	England

PCR: Polymerase chain reaction; RAS: Recurrent aphthous stomatitis

Table 3. Articles evaluating the effect of different factors on the production of tumor necrosis factoralpha (TNF- α) and effect of TNF- α on human oral keratinocytes (HOK)

				•••••	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
References	Study	Country	Sample size		Results		
	design		RAS	Control			
Lewkowicz ²³	Case-control	Poland	11	12	CD4 ⁺ CD25 ⁺ T regulatory cells are defective in function and quantity and are unable to inhibit TNF-α secretion.		
					TNF- α with IFN γ together increase TLR2 expression, but		
Al-Samadi ²⁴	Case-control	Finland	10	10	they did not do it alone. The effect of TNF- α on TLR4		
					expression was not statistically significant.		
					In acute phase, RAS epithelium BD2 (an antimicrobial		
Al-Samadi ²⁵	Case-control	Finland	8	7	peptide) was stained strongly. In HOK cell culture, BD2		
					increased by TNF- α and synergistically together with IL-17C.		
					In HOK cell culture, cells incubated with IL-17C produced		
					more TNF- α than the group incubated without IL-17C. HOK		
Al-Samadi ²⁶	Case-control	Finland	5	5	in RAS lesions was stained strongly for IL-17C compered to		
					control, that was associated with increased epithelial		
					immunostaining of TNF- α .		

TNF- α : Tumor necrosis factor-alpha; IFN γ : Interferon-gamma; TLR: Toll-like receptor; RAS: Recurrent aphthous stomatitis; IL: Interleukin; BD: Beta defensin; HOK: Human oral keratinocytes

Effects of TNF-a were established to be associated with activation of a cascade of inflammatory events, enhancing expression of adhesion molecules and activation of neutrophils in addition to acting as a co-stimulator for T cell activation and antibody production.³¹



Figure 2. Forest plot of the tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF- α) -308 A/G polymorphism and recurrent aphthous stomatitis (RAS) susceptibility in A: allelic model (G vs. A), B: homozygote model (GG vs. AA), C: heterozygote model (AG vs. GG), D: recessive model (AA vs. AG + GG), E: dominant model (AA + AG vs. GG) CI: Confidence interval

112	J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol/ Summer 2020; Vol. 9, No. 3	

Different results were obtained in studies that examined TNF-a level. This difference may be partly due to patient differences, RAS subtypes, research methods, or sample size. Another important factor to consider is the interaction of genes and cytokines as well as the effect of gene polymorphism on cytokine production. In addition, none of the studies examined the effect of age and sex on TNF-a levels although these important factors should be considered in future studies. A remarkable point is that, in most studies, salivary TNF-a levels are higher in the RAS group than in healthy individuals, so it suggests that TNF-a may be a potential salivary marker for this disease. Considering two main advantages of easy access and noninvasive collection by intermediate-educated individuals, whole saliva is an affordable tool for monitoring recurrent diseases and screening systemic disorders.

The TNF- α gene is located on the chromosome 6 and several single nucleotide polymorphisms have been detected in its promoter region. Studies have indicated that a G-to-A mutation in the -308 promoter section is accompanied by an increase in TNF-α production.^{32,33} Studies have also been conducted on the association between TNF-a gene polymorphism and susceptibility to aphthous ulcers. In some studies, a positive was found between TNF association polymorphism and susceptibility to aphthous ulcers;^{20,21} and in other study, no association was found.²² This discrepancy in studies in some comparative models and inconsistent conclusions may be attributed to several factors. First, these studies included people from different populations in different countries and could be the result of differences in the race of the individuals studied. Second, it may be the result of

different etiologies of RAS. Third, some studies did not use Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE). Another reason may be related to the low statistical population of some studies. In this meta-analysis, no association was found between TNF- α -308 G/A single nucleotide polymorphism and overall RAS risk except in recessive model. Recessive model is likely to be protective against RAS when compared to other models.

Al-Samadi et al.²⁴⁻²⁶ concluded that abnormal apoptosis of epithelial cells that progressed to necrosis, released the danger signals. Exposure of pathogen-specific receptors such as Toll-like receptor (TLR) to these danger signals increases the production of IL-17C and TNF-α and leads to inflammation and RAS.

Three limitations could be mentioned for the current study. First, sample size was limited for some groups. Second, our search was limited to articles with English abstract that may be considered language bias. Third, meta-analysis is a retrospective study in which methodological deficiencies of studies have remained.

Conclusion

Numerous effective factors on the production of TNF- α have been reported in RAS. In addition, TNF- α can cause RAS lesions through its effect on keratinocyte cells. It is hoped that this review article raises our awareness about the effect of TNF- α on the etiopathogenesis of RAS and opens up new ways of preventing and treating.

Conflict of Interests

Authors have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported by Tabriz University of Medical Sciences.

References

- 1. Scully C, Felix DH. Oral medicine--update for the dental practitioner. Aphthous and other common ulcers. Br Dent J 2005; 199(5): 259-64.
- 2. Slebioda Z, Szponar E, Kowalska A. Etiopathogenesis of recurrent aphthous stomatitis and the role of immunologic aspects: Literature review. Arch Immunol Ther Exp (Warsz) 2014; 62(3): 205-15.

J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol/ Summer 2020; Vol. 9, No. 3 113

- 3. Akintoye SO, Greenberg MS. Recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Dent Clin North Am 2014; 58(2): 281-97.
- 4. Motahari P. Evaluation of antioxidant-oxidant status of saliva in recurrent aphthous stomatitis: A systematic review. J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol 2020; 9(2): 60-4.
- 5. Bhosale SS, Rajput BS, Takkar H, Bhagat SV, Vagger RM, Shaikh MIK. Establishment of role of IL-2, IL-10 and IL-12 in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis-a clinical study. J Contemp Dent Pract 2018; 19(10): 1242-5.
- 6. Wei W, Sun Q, Deng Y, Wang Y, Du G, Song C, et al. Mixed and inhomogeneous expression profile of Th1/Th2 related cytokines detected by cytometric bead array in the saliva of patients with oral lichen planus. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol 2018; 126(2): 142-51.
- 7. Hegde S, Ajila V, Babu S, Kumari S, Ullal H, Madiyal A. Evaluation of salivary tumour necrosis factor-alpha in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Eur Oral Res 2018; 52(3): 157-61.
- 8. Chaudhuri K, Nair KK, Ashok L. Salivary levels of TNF-alpha in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis: A cross-sectional study. J Dent Res Dent Clin Dent Prospects 2018; 12(1): 45-8.
- 9. Avci E, Akarslan ZZ, Erten H, Coskun-Cevher S. Oxidative stress and cellular immunity in patients with recurrent aphthous ulcers. Braz J Med Biol Res 2014; 47(5): 355-60.
- Eguia-del VA, Martinez-Conde-Llamosas R, Lopez-Vicente J, Uribarri-Etxebarria A, Aguirre-Urizar JM. Salivary levels of Tumour Necrosis Factor-alpha in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Med Oral Patol Oral Cir Bucal 2011; 16(1): e33-e36.
- 11. Lewkowicz N, Kur B, Kurnatowska A, Tchorzewski H, Lewkowicz P. Expression of Th1/Th2/Th3/Th17-related genes in recurrent aphthous ulcers. Arch Immunol Ther Exp (Warsz) 2011; 59(5): 399-406.
- 12. Borra RC, de Mesquita BF, de Andrade LM, Villanova FE, Andrade PM. Toll-like receptor activity in recurrent aphthous ulceration. J Oral Pathol Med 2009; 38(3): 289-98.
- 13. Albanidou-Farmaki E, Markopoulos AK, Kalogerakou F, Antoniades DZ. Detection, enumeration and characterization of T helper cells secreting type 1 and type 2 cytokines in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Tohoku J Exp Med 2007; 212(2): 101-5.
- 14. Dalghous AM, Freysdottir J, Fortune F. Expression of cytokines, chemokines, and chemokine receptors in oral ulcers of patients with Behcet's disease (BD) and recurrent aphthous stomatitis is Th1-associated, although Th2-association is also observed in patients with BD. Scand J Rheumatol 2006; 35(6): 472-5.
- 15. Boras VV, Lukac J, Brailo V, Picek P, Kordic D, Zilic IA. Salivary interleukin-6 and tumor necrosis factor-alpha in patients with recurrent aphthous ulceration. J Oral Pathol Med 2006; 35(4): 241-3.
- Lewkowicz N, Lewkowicz P, Banasik M, Kurnatowska A, Tchorzewski H. Predominance of Type 1 cytokines and decreased number of CD4(+)CD25(+high) T regulatory cells in peripheral blood of patients with recurrent aphthous ulcerations. Immunol Lett 2005; 99(1): 57-62.
- 17. Sun A, Chia JS, Chang YF, Chiang CP. Levamisole and Chinese medicinal herbs can modulate the serum interleukin-6 level in patients with recurrent aphthous ulcerations. J Oral Pathol Med 2003; 32(4): 206-14.
- Yun-Qiu Z. The relationship between recurrent oral ulcer and serum TNF-α and TGF-β levels. Medical Journal of Wuhan University 2001; 22(3):238.
- 19. Natah SS, Hayrinen-Immonen R, Hietanen J, Malmstrom M, Konttinen YT. Immunolocalization of tumor necrosis factor-alpha expressing cells in recurrent aphthous ulcer lesions (RAU). J Oral Pathol Med 2000; 29(1): 19-25.
- Sun M, Fu SM, Dong GY, Wu D, Wang GX, Wu Y. Inflammatory factors gene polymorphism in recurrent oral ulceration. J Oral Pathol Med 2013; 42(7): 528-34.
- Guimaraes AL, Correia-Silva JF, Sa AR, Victoria JM, Diniz MG, Costa FO, et al. Investigation of functional gene polymorphisms IL-1beta, IL-6, IL-10 and TNF-alpha in individuals with recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Arch Oral Biol 2007; 52(3): 268-72.
- 22. Bazrafshani MR, Hajeer AH, Ollier WE, Thornhill MH. Recurrent aphthous stomatitis and gene polymorphisms for the inflammatory markers TNF-alpha, TNF-beta and the vitamin D receptor: No association detected. Oral Dis 2002; 8(6): 303-7.
- Lewkowicz N, Lewkowicz P, Dzitko K, Kur B, Tarkowski M, Kurnatowska A, et al. Dysfunction of CD4+CD25high T regulatory cells in patients with recurrent aphthous stomatitis. J Oral Pathol Med 2008; 37(8): 454-61.
- Al-Samadi A, Drozd A, Salem A, Hietanen J, Hayrinen-Immonen R, Konttinen YT. Epithelial Cell Apoptosis in Recurrent Aphthous Ulcers. J Dent Res 2015; 94(7): 928-35.
- 25. Al-Samadi A, Salem A, Ainola M, Hietanen J, Hayrinen-Immonen R, Konttinen YT. Increased beta 2 defensin in recurrent aphthous ulcer. Oral Dis 2015; 21(3): 292-8.
- 26. Al-Samadi A, Kouri VP, Salem A, Ainola M, Kaivosoja E, Barreto G, et al. IL-17C and its receptor IL-17RA/IL-17RE identify human oral epithelial cell as an inflammatory cell in recurrent aphthous ulcer. J Oral Pathol Med 2014; 43(2): 117-24.
- 27. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses:

114 J Oral Health Oral Epidemiol/ Summer 2020; Vol. 9, No. 3

the PRISMA statement. PLoS Med 2009; 6(7): e1000097.

- 28. Boudin F, Nie JY, Bartlett JC, Grad R, Pluye P, Dawes M. Combining classifiers for robust PICO element detection. BMC Med Inform Decis Mak 2010; 10: 29.
- 29. Munn Z, Tufanaru C, Aromataris E. JBI's systematic reviews: Data extraction and synthesis. Am J Nurs 2014; 114(7): 49-54.
- 30. Thornhill MH, Baccaglini L, Theaker E, Pemberton MN. A randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial of pentoxifylline for the treatment of recurrent aphthous stomatitis. Arch Dermatol 2007; 143(4): 463-70.
- 31. Serrano NC, Millan P, Paez MC. Non-HLA associations with autoimmune diseases. Autoimmun Rev 2006; 5(3): 209-14.
- 32. Hajeer AH, Hutchinson IV. TNF-alpha gene polymorphism: Clinical and biological implications. Microsc Res Tech 2000; 50(3): 216-28.
- 33. Helmig S, Aliahmadi N, Stephan P, Dohrel J, Schneider J. TNF-alpha -308 genotypes are associated with TNF-alpha and TGF-beta(1) mRNA expression in blood leucocytes of humans. Cytokine 2011; 53(3): 306-10.